Template for comments and secretariat observations

Date: 2nd May 2013	Document: **Draft BS EN 16515**	Comments submitted on behalf of the Institute of Historic Building Conservation

MB/ NC[1]	Line number (e.g. 17)	Clause/ Subclause (e.g. 3.1)	Paragraph/ Figure/ Table/ (e.g. Table 1)	Type of comment[2]	Comments	Proposed change	Observations of the secretariat
		Throughout			Inconsistent use of characterization & characterisation		
		1.3			It would be helpful to mention that all investigation and analysis must be proportional to the significance of the building or artefact being investigated, and the likely level of intervention. Even something that is extremely valuable may not warrant full analysis if it is in excellent condition. Conversely, a fairly run-of the mill object may warrant detailed examination if the stone is decaying rapidly and inexplicably and threatens the survival of the object.	Add sentence to say "All investigation and analysis must be proportional to the significance of the building or artefact being investigated, its condition and the likely level of intervention."	
		3			The term 'analysis' is frequently used in relation to characterising stone and it would be helpful to have a definition of its meaning	Include a definition of the term 'analysis'	
		4	3		"The condition report or survey should be supplemented by sufficient information to allow a preliminary classification of the stone and its state of conservation." The term 'preliminary classification' is misleading as the process described (collection of information on stone type, characteristics, colour etc) does not result in the stone being placed in some sort of class. There is no classification system based on this information.	Change text to read 'preliminary assessment'	

1 **MB** = Member body / **NC** = National Committee (enter the ISO 3166 two-letter country code, e.g. CN for China; comments from the ISO/CS editing unit are identified by ******)
2 **Type of comment:** **ge** = general **te** = technical **ed** = editorial

Template for comments and secretariat observations

Date: 2nd May 2013	Document: **Draft BS EN 16515**	Comments submitted on behalf of the Institute of Historic Building Conservation

MB/ NC[1]	Line number (e.g. 17)	Clause/ Subclause (e.g. 3.1)	Paragraph/ Figure/ Table/ (e.g. Table 1)	Type of comment[2]	Comments	Proposed change	Observations of the secretariat
		4	3		"The condition report or survey should be supplemented by sufficient information to allow a preliminary classification of the stone and its state of conservation. This preliminary classification should include general stone type, the macroscopic characteristics, colour, texture, structural aspects and apparent state of conservation." Reference to 'state of conservation' – use of term is inconsistent with the definition of 'conservation' in BS 7913.	Change text to read 'state of preservation' or, better still, simply 'condition'.	
		4	Note		Munsell colour charts, originally developed for describing the colour of soils, are also widely used for describing stone colour.		
		5.1	1		List of information relating to the sample: Very important to know the orientation of the sample in relation to the stone from which it was taken.	Add 'orientation' to the list of information relating to the sample that should be recorded in the documentation.	
		5.1	1		To avoid confusion, better to stick to the term 'sample' rather than 'specimen'	Replace 'specimen' with 'sample'	
		5.2	Heading		Ditto	Ditto	
		5.2	1		"..this provides an initial estimation for their condition, colour range.." – poor use of English..."	Instead use ".. this enables an initial assessment of their condition, colour range.."	

1 **MB** = Member body / **NC** = National Committee (enter the ISO 3166 two-letter country code, e.g. CN for China; comments from the ISO/CS editing unit are identified by ******)
2 **Type of comment:** **ge** = general **te** = technical **ed** = editorial

Template for comments and secretariat observations

Date: 2nd May 2013	Document: **Draft BS EN 16515**	Comments submitted on behalf of the Institute of Historic Building Conservation

MB/ NC[1]	Line number (e.g. 17)	Clause/ Subclause (e.g. 3.1)	Paragraph/ Figure/ Table/ (e.g. Table 1)	Type of comment[2]	Comments	Proposed change	Observations of the secretariat
		5.2	2		"In all cases an accurate and detailed petrographic assessment should be further undertaken by an experienced professional. " This level of detail is NOT required in all cases – the level of investigation must be proportionate to the importance of the object/building being investigated and its condition	Amend to read: "If further information is required, a detailed petrographic assessment …"	
		5.3	4		The nature and extent of soiling is also significant and should be recorded.	Add 'Surface soiling – its nature, level of adhesion and whether this seems to be contributing to deterioration or is merely disfiguring' to the list of things to note	
		5.4			Clarify the meaning of "clay containing stones". As written, this means 'clay that contains stones' Should it not perhaps mean 'stones that contain clay'? If so, the text should be amended to read "clay-containing stones"?	Amend text to read "clay-containing stones".	
		5.6:	Note		No mention of methods for determining salts (qualitative and quantitative) or of the use of dilute hydrochloric acid to identify calcareous components. These are both simple tests that can be done during a preliminary assessment and yield important information at little cost.	Amend note to include reference to the methods for determining qualitative and quantitative salt content. Add reference to simple method of testing for presence of calcium carbonate in stone sample	

1 **MB** = Member body / **NC** = National Committee (enter the ISO 3166 two-letter country code, e.g. CN for China; comments from the ISO/CS editing unit are identified by ******)
2 **Type of comment:** **ge** = general **te** = technical **ed** = editorial

MB/ NC[1]	Line number (e.g. 17)	Clause/ Subclause (e.g. 3.1)	Paragraph/ Figure/ Table/ (e.g. Table 1)	Type of comment[2]	Comments	Proposed change	Observations of the secretariat
		5.7			As well as water absorption behaviour, it might also be useful to measure the drying behaviour of the stone (which is closely related to micro-porosity), since this can have a significant effect on stone durability and deterioration.	Include reference to the methods of establishing the drying behaviour of stone	
		5.7.1	2		In the list of examples at the end of the paragraph, it would be helpful to mention micro-porosity (as a proportion of total porosity) of a stone, as this is critical to stone durability and deterioration.	Include reference to micro-porosity of the stone	
		5.8			As well as the properties listed, it may also be helpful to record the degree of surface cohesion of the stone. There is a scotch tape test that can be used as a simple field test.	Include reference to methods for determining the surface cohesion of the stone	
		5.8			As well as the properties listed, it may also be useful to record the hardness of the stone. Relative hardness is sometimes described using Mohs' scale of hardness (this is a simple test that can be done *in situ* if necessary), and there are various other methods for determining hardness such as a Schmidt hammer.	Include explanation of methods for determining the relative and absolute hardness of stone	

1 **MB** = Member body / **NC** = National Committee (enter the ISO 3166 two-letter country code, e.g. CN for China; comments from the ISO/CS editing unit are identified by ******)
2 **Type of comment:** **ge** = general **te** = technical **ed** = editorial

Template for comments and secretariat observations

Date: 2nd May 2013	Document: **Draft BS EN 16515**	Comments submitted on behalf of the Institute of Historic Building Conservation

MB/ NC[1]	Line number (e.g. 17)	Clause/ Subclause (e.g. 3.1)	Paragraph/ Figure/ Table/ (e.g. Table 1)	Type of comment[2]	Comments	Proposed change	Observations of the secretariat
		5.8.1			As well as the method described in EN 1926, Drilling Resistance Measurement (DRM) can be an effective means of measuring compressive strength of stone, and can give a more detailed profile of how strength varies at depth within a piece of stone. It can be carried out *in situ*, leaving only a small drill hole in the stone, so may be used on valuable historic stone, where taking a larger sample for destructive testing would not be permitted. It is sometimes used to assess the increase in strength of stone following consolidation treatment.	Include reference to the use of DRM for determining compressive strength of stone.	

1 **MB** = Member body / **NC** = National Committee (enter the ISO 3166 two-letter country code, e.g. CN for China; comments from the ISO/CS editing unit are identified by ******)
2 **Type of comment:** **ge** = general **te** = technical **ed** = editorial